

Multimodality in Literary Text
Lecture
Presenting Speech and Speakers: Quoting Verbs
By: Lerissa Daniela, S.S. M.Pd.

Learning objective

At the end of this meeting, you are expected to understand:

1. How to Do CDA
2. Quoting Verbs
3. Categories of Quoting Verbs: 5 categories
4. Representing Speakers' Attitude: Gaze and Poses

A. How to Do CDA

In the previous lecture, it has been discussed how CDA is used to make sense of ideology and power in textual discourses. Critical Discourse Analysis aims to create approaches and a theoretical framework that could effectively understand that relations with a particular emphasis on uncovering and explaining the strategies and traditions within discourse that expose political and ideological engagement. CDA is also dedicated to take the political action and promote the societal transformation (Fairclough and Wodak, 1997: 258).

The main reference of this lecture and the next seven lectures will be taken from book of David Machin and Andrea Mayr entitled "How To Do Critical Discourse Analysis" (2012). They provided useful guidelines on how to analyze text using its specific language and grammatical features. The topic utilized from the book will cover:

1. Presenting Speech and Speakers: Quoting Verbs
2. Representing People: Language and Identity
3. Representing Action: Transitivity and Verb Processes
4. Concealing and Taking for Granted: Nominalization and Presupposition
5. Persuading with Abstraction: Rhetoric and Metaphor
6. Committing and Evading: Truth, Modality, and Hedging

Even though, the book will be the main reference but I will also add my own thought and interpretation along through the discussion. Furthermore, I will add examples from various media to give better understanding to the discussion or topic.

So this chapter will elaborate the tools to analyze language and grammatical, and visual features in more specific. The first thing to start is by looking at the importance of describing and analyzing they

way people are represented in text and image. There will be some important language and visual resources to be notified in evaluating the social actors' ideas and values that are not clearly stated in the discourse. In the first part of this lecture, we will begin with the representation in language and in the next part we will move on to visual representation through gaze and poses.

B. Quoting Verbs

Quoting verbs refer to the words or phrases used to introduce direct speech or reported speech in discourse. They are essential in analyzing how speech is presented, attributed, and framed within a text.

In a spoken or written communication, we often quote someone's statement when we want to share it with someone else. In this quoting statement, we might choose different words which we think more suitable.

For example, there is a friend of mine, named Mawar, says "**My roommates don't make their beds.**"

Then when I talk to someone else, I tell her about Mawar's story. At this moment, I might do it different ways. I can do direct quotation of Mawar's statement, but I can also choose different word or phrase to re-state it.

For example:

"Mawar **said** that her roommates don't make their beds.", or

"Mawar **complained about** her roommates who don't make their beds."

The above examples show two different types of quoting verbs. In the first example I use "said" which sounds neutral and normal. But in the second example, I use "complained about" which sounds more emotional and expressive. The phrase "complained about" becomes my impression about my roommates' attitude, behavior and characters. My partner who listened to me would also catch different perceptions between the two statements above. Such choices of quoting verbs can lead the recipient to believe in the statement just the way it is or consider and normalize it as my complaining behavior.

Regarding the above simulation of quoting verbs, Machin and Mayr (2012) explained that quoting verbs can be used to give certain implicit information. The choice of quoting verbs can create certain perception of the speaker and the object being stated, to the receiver. Even though I just simply state Mawar's statement but the way I choose the quoting verbs would change the sense of the statement. Through the choice of quoting verbs there are options to tell the truth or to exaggerate it.

This following example, which is taken from Machin and Mayr (2012, 58) will give a clearer picture on how the choice of quoting verbs can shape our interpretation about certain issue or the actor.

“The company **announced** that striking workers would be punished.”

“The workers **grumbled** about the problems with conditions.”

The quoting verbs ‘announced’ and ‘grumbled’ in both sentences bring a certain interpretation to the readers. If both verbs are changed into ‘said’ then the sense would be totally different. It would be just a neutral sentence. But the choice of word ‘announced’ in the first sentence create a sense of power relation between the company and the workers. The company has the legitimacy and power to punish the striking workers. Meanwhile, the word ‘grumbled’ in the second sentence shows that the workers do not have enough power toward the company.

However, switching the quoting verbs from the second sentence to the first and vice versa, would create another interpretation to the readers.

“The company **grumbled** that striking workers would be punished.”

“The workers **announced** about the problems with conditions.”

These two sentences now do not appear the same way anymore. Now, the first sentence brings the sense of unreasonable policy in giving punishment to the workers. Meanwhile, the second sentence crates a sense of power of the workers and the have the authority to complain based on the actual problem happens not merely because their ‘complaining’ characters.

C. Categories of Quoting Verbs

Coulthard (1994) elaborated a systematic meaning potentials of quoting verbs which consists of eight. It is important to note the precise intention of using certain quoting verbs which lead to a certain meaning. Based on that, Machin and Mayr (2012) classify the quoting verbs into five aspects.

1. Neutral Structuring Verbs

The examples can be found in words: ‘say’, ‘tell’. ‘ask’. This category expresses a statement as the way it is without any implicit meaning. In the previous example of sentence “Mawar **said** that her roommates don’t make their beds”, I do not have any particular implicit meaning, I just tell exactly as what Mawar told me. People who are represented with neutral verbs are tend to be disengaged or do not have close personal relationship (Machin and Mayr, 2012, 59).

2. Metapositional Verbs

This category expresses ‘author’s interpretation of a speaker’ (Machin and Mayr, 2012, 60). The examples can be found in words: ‘declare’, ‘urge’, and ‘grumble’ which have the sense of decisive,

ruling and expressive. In the previous example of sentence, the word 'announce' sounds more decisive. It shows the decisiveness of the company to the employees.

3. Metalinguistic Verbs

It refers to the specific language used by the speaker. For example:

"It was really hard to live with those messy people." Jane **narrated**.

"It was really hard to live with those messy people." Jane **stated**.

This first sentence can be used to express the ironic effect while the second one has a bigger neutral sense to report the truth of what happened.

4. Descriptive Verbs

It is about the interaction of the speaker to mark his or her matter and attitude to what he or she says. The sentences can be indicated with the word 'whisper' or 'laugh'. So if I change the sentence into "Mawar **whispers** that her roommates don't make their beds," then the listeners will not focus only to what she says but how she says it. This would also signify the attitudes, power relations and likelihood of truth (Machin and Mayr, 2012). In the above sentence, 'whispering' would create an interpretation that the speaker do not have enough power to speak up freely. Her whispering attitude would bring a sense that there is something wrong in the situation that should keep her in silence.

5. Transcript Verbs

It is marking the pause or repetition or continuation of the discourse by using the suitable verbs. For example: "Mawar complained about her roommates who don't make their beds. She **added** that they are quite lazy." This kind of word is also often found in news article where the journalist writes "he added" or "he continued" to give an impression of him as offering something more while most of the time it is basically just the same point.

The above choice of verbs in the sentences are used to show that some individuals have more power and some others are less important, that they are seen as legitimate or not. The sentences can influence how we understand the roles of different people or events, even if those roles are not directly mentioned. Quoting verbs can also indicate if someone is being portrayed negatively or positively, or if they are speaking in a more moderate way, like when someone is described as 'remarking' instead of 'shouting.'

For example:

The immigrants were **shouting** for the abuse the have been suffering.

The immigrants were **remarking** for the abuse the have been suffering.

In the first sentence, the immigrants appear to be emotional and painful by using the verb 'shouting', rather than the second sentence. The word 'remarking' in the second sentence makes the immigrants appear moderate and decent.

In the following example we can see another example of quoting verb in showing the degree of fact or reliability.

Home > National

Police Claim Tear Gas Did Not Cause Death in Kanjuruhan Tragedy

Figure 1 (Ismail, 2022)

The above figure shows an article headline taken from tempo.co. According to Coulthard (1994) in Machin and Mayr (2012), the word 'claim' is categorized as metapositional expressive verb. 'Claim' does not naturally express the factual event. It is subjective that can invite doubt and can be contested. The headline can be interpreted differently if the word 'claim' is changed into 'explain'. The police's statement becomes more reliable by using the word 'explain'. The meaning would appear as the police give us the factual information rather than simply their subjective opinion.

The full article of the above news headline is also an interesting case study to discuss. It shows several aspects of verbs which indicate the lack of agency.

"Indonesian Police **stated** that the victims in the Kanjuruhan football tragedy in Malang died due to a lack of oxygen, instead of tear gas. The police spokesman Insp. Gen. Dedi Prasetyo **said** this finding was based on experts' statements." (Ismail, 2022)

'Stated' and 'said' are part of neutral structuring verb. At the beginning of the article, the journalist uses those two verbs to express the neutral position of the police, represented by Insp. Gen. Dedi Prasetyo, in case of the tear gas. However, in another sentence, there is another expression that shows the police lack of confidence and guiltiness.

"Dedi **explained** that the investigators had asked for experts' views and concluded that tear gas is not lethal." (Ismail, 2022)

In the above sentence, the police do not simply 'say' but they 'explained' something. The word 'explained' shows that they want to clarify or to enlighten the case from the perspective of the experts as well. They try to emphasize that their claim is valid, not merely their own thought or opinion.

"Dedi **asserted** that no victim died due to tear gas as explained by experts and specialist doctors who treated the victims." (Ismail, 2022)

In the next sentence of the news articles, the journalist uses word 'asserted' which is part of metapositional directives. It gives the sense of decisive and ruling to the police in assuring the public that they are not the ones causing the tragedy. However, on the other side, it also shows a glimpse of their worry that they are accused of causing the tragedy in Malang.

D. Representing Speakers' attitude through visual semiotic resources

As CDA focuses on discourse, the image appears to support the discourse itself as we usually see in various media platforms. Such as, book cover consist of text and image, as well as the magazine. News articles in newspaper are not only consist of headlines but also images. Social media posts consist of captions and text in image or captions and image only. Therefore, the image is also an important aspect in CDA analysis.

In this chapter, Machin and Mayr (2012), focuses the image on the gaze and poses in the relation of their statements or speeches in quoting verbs. In the previous chapter about Multimodal Discourse Analysis, we once discussed about gaze and image act as part of interactional metafunction. In line with MDA, Machin and Mayr argue that gaze and poses in the image are managed to present certain interpretation of the attitude, character, and identity of the person in the image. These gaze and poses become semiotic resources that can be implicitly analyzed along with their speeches. This verbal and non-verbal communication bring the connection between participants in the frame and the viewers.

1. Gaze

Machin and Mayr are also inspired by the concept of Kress and van Leeuwen in 1996 about the visual grammar which one of them is through the gaze. The important part of someone's attitude in the speech or image is her gaze, whether she is looking at the viewers or looking at something or someone else. Analyzing someone's gaze along with the other verbal and non-verbal attitudes means that analyzing them as semiotic resources. These semiotic resources allow could signify and convey certain meanings or interpretations. Both speech act and image act can be realized by mood system (Machin and Mayr, 2012). Gaze is one point to build this mood system. By examining someone's gaze along with the other semiotic resources, we can figure out their mood or emotion. Please take a look at this figure as the example:



Figure 2 (9gag, 2023)

This picture is taken from 9GAG Instagram posts. Most comments agree to this meme, either from the the girls opinons or the boys who have the same thought about their girls. This meme, which consists of text and image, is indeed relatable to the current girl-boy relationship. The choice of middle-aged man in the image, the above caption, and the below direct quotation build a certain mood and emotion that the viewers can relate. The image shows a 'demand' gaze as the man is looking at the viewers. Even though the gaze is the same between the left and right images, but he gaze is accompanied by two different facial expressions. Each of them matches with the caption and the below direct quotion to strenghten the meaning it represents to make it relatable to the viewers.

The following figure also shows the meaning making through gaze along with the other semiotic resources. If the 'demand' brings a relationship between the object and the viewers, 'offering' gaze shows the relationship among objects, in which the object is looking at another object in the frame. Not only the 'demand' and 'offering' gaze, but looking off the frame also has potential meaning. When the participants in the image is looking off frame, the viewers are invited to examine what they are thinking about (Machin and Mayr, 2012).



Figure 2 (Lukmono, 2022)

This is an example of an image where the person is looking off frame. His name is Ferdy Sambo, a former Head of the National Police's professional and security division (*kadiv propam*) before he was expelled and arrested for a murder case of his subordinate. Even though he is wearing a mask, we can still interpret through his gaze and poses. His eyes and the way he sits down, all these semiotic resources are in line with the article title "Jadwal Sidang Ferdy Sambo CS Pekan Ini, Mulai Selasa hingga Kamis." He looks overwhelmed exhausted because of his long court schedule.

2. Poses

When analyzing the connotations of a pose, Machin and Mayr (2012) suggest us to ask these basic questions:

- a) Does the pose make the person seems confident and take up space, or does it make her appear more reserved?
- b) Is the pose intended to impress the viewers, or does the person seems self-contained?
- c) Does the pose convey a sense of relaxation, or does it show intensity and tension?
- d) Does the pose make the person seem open and approachable, or does it make them appear closed off and distant?
- e) If there are multiple people, do they have similar poses, or do they each have different postures?
- f) Are they depicted as being close and intimate, or is there a sense of distance between them?

These questions help you understand the implied messages conveyed by a pose. A professional photographer said that postures of the artists are created to convey something about them. The postures could indicate that they are approachable, independent or moody, or whether they are portrayed as an entity of something or as their own individuals. Poses can also bring certain connotation meanings of specific identities or broader values and ideas (Machin and Mayr, 2012).

I myself is a person who like to be captured by camera which gives me a personal satisfaction. I like to see myself as an object of photograph in which I can explore different poses, angles, and shots. Regarding the above basic question of poses, I will present several of my pictures as examples.



Figure 3

This picture visualizes my confidence to take some spaces in the red carpet and backdrop of JIU Commencement Ceremony event. I show no hesitation yet reserved as shown on my pose, gesture and smiling face. As I said earlier that I like to be captured for my own satisfaction. I have never had any intention to impress the others who see the picture of mine. I just want to share in my social media about my involvement in one of the biggest annual events at JIU.

Instagram



Figure 4

Compared to the previous example, this picture conveys a sense of intensity and tension as shown from my serious facial expression. It is because the occasion here is more formal as this picture is taken from an annual meeting of my previous university. The rectorate members and all department heads are gathered to evaluate the current academic year and plan the next academic year. Clearly, I appear more reserved

not as confident as the first one. My gaze and the way I hold the microphone implicitly show my lack of confidence in answering the questions asked to me. Therefore, I appear more closed off and distant.



Figure 5

The last is related to the question number 4 and 5 of Machin and Mayr's basic question about poses as there are several participants in one frame. Here we are the English Literature Lecturer of JIU. We all show the same poses, gestures, and expression which indicate excitement. We even wear the same t-shirt written in Indonesian slang language #guedosensasing which means 'I am English Literature lecturer'. This picture shows our professional intimacy as work mates in the same department.

Summary and Conclusion

At the beginning, we discussed about quoting verbs and its categorization. There are five categories: neutral structuring verb, metapositional verbs, metalinguistic verbs, descriptive verbs, and transcript verbs. In the analysis of quoting verbs earlier in the middle of this lecture's discussion, we discussed two cases that carried images. The framework of gaze in images can help us to examine how gaze encourage viewer to evaluate the events implicitly. The powerful analysis of the participants in the image can be examined not only by the text or discourse but also by the represented images. Not only the gaze, poses also send certain messages to the viewers. Poses in the image can be interpreted differently based on the understanding of the viewers. We have discussed 6 basic questions by Machin and Mayr as the guide to understand the connotative meaning of poses in the image.

References:

- Fairclough, N., (2013). *Critical Discourse Analysis: The Critical Study of Language* (2nd ed.). Routledge
- Machin, D. and Mayr, A. (2012). *How To Do Critical Discourse Analysis*. SAGE.
- Van Dijk, T.A., (2015). *Critical Discourse Analysis* (2nd Ed). (pp 466-485). Wiley-Blackwell
<https://discourses.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/07/Teun-A.-van-Dijk-2015-Critical-discourse-Analysis.pdf>

Sources of Figures:

Figure 1

9GAG: Go Fun the World. (2023). *Yes, that's me*. 9gag Instagram

<https://www.instagram.com/p/CtmV2rZu08Q/?igshid=MzRIODBiNWFIZA==>

Figure 2

Lukmono, A., (2022). *Jadwal Sidang Ferdy Sambo CS Pekan Ini, Mulai Selasa hingga Kamis*. Pilar.id

<https://www.pilar.id/jadwal-sidang-ferdy-sambo-cs-pekan-ini-mulai-selasa-hingga-kamis/>